



# Teachers' Attitudes Towards the Effectiveness of Collaborative Reflection Support Method: The Impact of Achievement Goal and Community Identification

Ying Yan, Xian-Jiaotong Liverpool University, China

Rong Yan, Xian-Jiaotong Liverpool University, China\*

 <https://orcid.org/0000-0001-6570-4824>

Samad Zare, Xian-Jiaotong Liverpool University, China

 <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-0147-3729>

Yixuan Li, Xian-Jiaotong Liverpool University, China

## ABSTRACT

This study aimed to explore how minute paper method (MPM) reconstructs the attitude towards the collaborative reflection among ten primary school English teachers with different levels of achievement goal (AG) and community identification (CI). Through a half-year intervention and a semi-structured interview, the following results were obtained: (1) Teachers with different AG and CI levels identified different difficulties and obstacles based on their prior collaborative reflecting experiences. The low AG and CI group expressed substantial fear of bonding with other team members, while the high level group expected more external resources and professional training; (2) MPM significantly improved teachers' overall attitude towards their reflective engagement and critical thinking, while the effectiveness of MPM was significantly affected by the level of teachers' AG and CI. Specifically, MPM was found to be most effective for the group with medium AG and CI levels. This study provides some valuable insights on collaborative reflection and teacher development research.

## KEYWORDS

Collaborative Reflection, Achievement Goals, Community Identification, The Minute Paper Method, Primary School Teachers

DOI: 10.4018/IJTEPD.333899

\*Corresponding Author

This article published as an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>) which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and production in any medium, provided the author of the original work and original publication source are properly credited.

## INTRODUCTION

As an integral part of successful teaching (Woolway et al., 2019), reflection is crucial to teachers' professional development (Brown et al., 2021; Buschor & Kamm, 2015; Jarvis et al., 2014; Van Braak et al., 2022) in that it not only provides teachers with opportunities to bridge theory and practice but also supports self and peer guidance (Woolway et al., 2019). In essence, there is a great deal of variation in how reflection is perceived, conducted, and evaluated, as well as in how much focus is given to it (Tight, 2023). Different from individual reflection, collaborative reflection refers to the procedures by which members of a specific community reflect through the outcomes of this process (Jiang & Zheng, 2021), prompting teachers to think through their professional responsibilities that they were not previously aware of or even ignored (Lin et al., 2013). Therefore, collaborative reflection among teachers emphasizes and prioritizes collective teaching and learning feedback and critical thinking in an educational context (Kalk et al., 2019; Shin, 2021).

Given its socially interactive nature, collaborative reflection is inevitably affected by multiple sociocultural factors, such as values, beliefs, ethics, cultural diversity, norms, and social relationships (Jiang, 2019; Jiang & Zheng, 2021). However, Korthagen (2004) revealed that teachers' collaborative reflection was often limited to superficial aspects of behavior. Tigelaar et al. (2008) emphasized the importance of teachers' beliefs and values to collaborative reflection, pointing out that teachers tended to focus narrowly on technical issues (the "how to"), but paid less attention to the underlying moral, political, and emotional dimensions. Kelchtermans and Hamilton (2004) specified the moral dimension as beliefs about codes and rules, norms and values, expectations and professional identity, while the political dimension was believed to refer to relationships with others including interests, power, loyalty, and responsibilities. Kreijns et al. (2003) argued that face-to-face interactions transmit visual and nonverbal cues, which are of great value in forming, establishing, and maintaining social relationships in a group context. Jiang and Zheng (2021) explored the hurdles that kindergarten teachers encountered in collaborative reflection and how to overcome these obstacles. Through underscoring the collaborative dimensions of teacher reflection and framing collaborative reflection as both a metacognitive mechanism and a social practice, their study emphasized the critical roles that team identity and cohesion played in successful collaborative reflection in a collective-minded cultural context.

In addition to sociocultural factors, numerous studies have explored the association between individual differences and collaborative reflection (Kalk et al., 2019), among which community identification (CI) and achievement goals (AG) have been identified as the two crucial variables that are worthy of attention (Huang et al., 2021). As a critical factor leading to successful community building (Qu & Lee, 2011), community identification is defined as an individual's sense of belonging to a group (Tajfel, 1978). Earlier studies showed that community identity played an important role in the establishment of team members' cognitive and emotional trust and understanding of the common good (Rockmann & Northcraft, 2008; Wann, 2006; Wann & Polk, 2007). Zumbrunn et al. (2014) highlighted the effects of sense of belonging on students' motivation and academic success. Other studies found that members with high CI levels were more likely to change their original thoughts and behaviors in line with the group's shared values or interests, with reduced stress, increased self-esteem (Chiu et al., 2015), greater team spirit (Chang et al., 2020; Ergün & Avcı, 2018), and a more positive mentality (Han & Harms, 2010). McNamara et al. (2021) illustrated that the specific geographic-based sense of belonging enabled the group members to better cope with community diversity and become more engaged and active in group activities. Apart from the impact of CI on collaborative reflection, Gutiérrez et al. (2019) looked at how reflective practice helped pre-service teachers build their professional identities. The results show that teachers strengthened their professional identities in three extremely pertinent ways, including gaining self-assurance in problem-solving capacity, enhancing appreciation of collaboration, and raising awareness of the necessity for teachers to change.

16 more pages are available in the full version of this document, which may be purchased using the "Add to Cart" button on the publisher's webpage: [www.igi-global.com/article/teachers-attitudes-towards-the-effectiveness-of-collaborative-reflection-support-method/333899](http://www.igi-global.com/article/teachers-attitudes-towards-the-effectiveness-of-collaborative-reflection-support-method/333899)

## Related Content

---

### Preparing Pre-service Early Childhood Candidates for Diverse Classrooms: The Open Doors Program

Natalie Young, Gregory James Conderman and Myoungwhon Jung (2019). *International Journal of Teacher Education and Professional Development* (pp. 37-52).

[www.irma-international.org/article/preparing-pre-service-early-childhood-candidates-for-diverse-classrooms/233501](http://www.irma-international.org/article/preparing-pre-service-early-childhood-candidates-for-diverse-classrooms/233501)

### Integrating Mentees in Mentoring Activities

El-Hussein A. Y. Aly (2018). *Mentorship Strategies in Teacher Education* (pp. 182-196).

[www.irma-international.org/chapter/integrating-mentees-in-mentoring-activities/204160](http://www.irma-international.org/chapter/integrating-mentees-in-mentoring-activities/204160)

### Joint Professional Development of Teacher Candidates and Mentoring Teachers in Using Project-Based Learning for 21st Century Learning Outcomes

Neal Shambaugh (2016). *Teacher Education: Concepts, Methodologies, Tools, and Applications* (pp. 1255-1274).

[www.irma-international.org/chapter/joint-professional-development-of-teacher-candidates-and-mentoring-teachers-in-using-project-based-learning-for-21st-century-learning-outcomes/153362](http://www.irma-international.org/chapter/joint-professional-development-of-teacher-candidates-and-mentoring-teachers-in-using-project-based-learning-for-21st-century-learning-outcomes/153362)

### Improving Indian Teachers' Readiness to Adopt New Methodologies: Role of Learner-Centered In-Service Training

Nandini Narayanan (2020). *International Journal of Teacher Education and Professional Development* (pp. 102-120).

[www.irma-international.org/article/improving-indian-teachers-readiness-to-adopt-new-methodologies/243394](http://www.irma-international.org/article/improving-indian-teachers-readiness-to-adopt-new-methodologies/243394)

## The Power of Metaphor in Bringing Clarity for Learners in Learner-Centered Design

John Ewing and Doug Reid (2017). *Handbook of Research on Learner-Centered Pedagogy in Teacher Education and Professional Development* (pp. 274-290).

[www.irma-international.org/chapter/the-power-of-metaphor-in-bringing-clarity-for-learners-in-learner-centered-design/163498](http://www.irma-international.org/chapter/the-power-of-metaphor-in-bringing-clarity-for-learners-in-learner-centered-design/163498)