



Chapter XI

Concerns with “Mutual Constitution”: A Critical Realist Commentary

Alistair Mutch
Nottingham Trent University, UK

Abstract

The case for “analytical dualism” as a means of approaching sociotechnical action is presented as an alternative to accounts which tend to conflate agency, structure, and technology. This is based on the work of Margaret Archer, whose work is, in turn, located in the traditions of critical realism. Her commitment to analytical dualism, which stresses both the importance of time in analysis and the emergent properties of structure, is argued to give a firmer purchase on the notion of context than the alternatives based on, for example, the work of Giddens and Latour.

Introduction

I want to start from the premise that what concerns many researchers in this area is how best to conceptualise the nature of “context.” From the point of view of those researching information systems (broadly constituted), the concern is to avoid what they perceive as being, at best, an over-emphasis on technical factors and, at worst,

the charge of technological determinism. They are keen, therefore, to emphasise the importance of the organisational, social, and cultural context in situating the development and use of technological artefacts. In this, they are joined by those studying information behaviour who are concerned to move away from a simple model of an “environment” in which behaviours are selected “rationally” toward the ongoing interaction of context and action. In this endeavour, the notion of “mutual constitution” is seductive, and the seduction is reinforced by those whose concepts are turned to for support. For some, this is the actor-network theory (ANT) of Bruno Latour and others, where there is a strong emphasis on action embedded in networks. For those working in this tradition, the removal of the hyphen from “socio-technical” is a deliberate act designed to stress the ineradicable coupling of the social and the technical. “Sociotechnical” action, therefore, represents the solution of the problem of context by its conflation into networks of actants. Not all analysts in this area, however, would wish to go so far and so, as in other areas of the study of organisation, the theorist of choice is often Anthony Giddens and his notion of “structuration.” What is taken from this is the mutual constitution of structure and agency, where structures form the ever-present conditions for the production and reproduction of agency. The strength of such notions is their emphasis on the irrevocable interconnections between action and context, but their weakness, it will be argued, is a tendency to privilege action over context. That is, when we explore these approaches in a little more detail, we find that they do not help as much as we might like in the specification of context. These criticisms will be addressed briefly, but, as they have been considered elsewhere (Jones, 1999; Mutch, 2002), the main part of the argument will be devoted to the presentation of an alternative approach. The contention is that ideas drawn from the philosophical tradition of critical realism, and specifically from the application to social theory by the sociologist Margaret Archer, are of much more value both in specifying what we mean by context and in conceptualising the relationship between context and action. This is, therefore, an act of what Basil Bernstein (1996) calls “secondary recontextualisation.” That is, the aim is to introduce some of the ideas and show how these can help existing approaches. Accordingly, after a brief introduction to some of the key tenets of critical realism, we look in a little more detail at what Archer has to say about the nature of structures (our “context”) and the relationship of structure to agency (our “action”). The key argument is that, while there is no society (and, hence, no technology and no information) without people, the challenge is to examine the interaction between the structures which people create (including information and technology) and the subsequent action in which people engage. These more general ideas are then explored in the context of writings on organisations and technology. It is important to stress here that critical realism does not purport to be a substantive theory of either of these two domains; rather, it offers some conceptual clarity on ontological and epistemological issues which can further help the development of domain specific theories.

13 more pages are available in the full version of this document, which may be purchased using the "Add to Cart" button on the publisher's webpage: www.igi-global.com/chapter/concerns-mutual-constitution/24721

Related Content

Optimization of MPPT Controller for Standalone Photovoltaic Systems

Jatin Soni and Kuntal Bhattacharjee (2023). *Perspectives on Social Welfare Applications' Optimization and Enhanced Computer Applications* (pp. 231-263).

www.irma-international.org/chapter/optimization-of-mppt-controller-for-standalone-photovoltaic-systems/328009

Future Science Press as an Example of Operational Optimization and Cybersecurity Resilience in Academic Publishing

Froilan Delute Mobo, Ana Liza Garcia, Achmad Riyanto and Rey Fremista (2026). *The Human Dimension of Cybersecurity: Cultivating a Protective Organizational Culture* (pp. 93-124).

www.irma-international.org/chapter/future-science-press-as-an-example-of-operational-optimization-and-cybersecurity-resilience-in-academic-publishing/395287

Chinese POS Disambiguation and Unknown Word Guessing with Lexicalized HMMs

Guohong Fu and Kang-Kwong Luke (2006). *International Journal of Technology and Human Interaction* (pp. 39-50).

www.irma-international.org/article/chinese-pos-disambiguation-unknown-word/2877

New Visual Literacies and Competencies for Education and the Workplace

Julie A. Delello and Rochell R. McWhorter (2016). *Handbook of Research on the Societal Impact of Digital Media* (pp. 127-162).

www.irma-international.org/chapter/new-visual-literacies-and-competencies-for-education-and-the-workplace/136670

Concerns with "Mutual Constitution": A Critical Realist Commentary

Alistair Mutch (2007). *Issues and Trends in Technology and Human Interaction* (pp. 230-244).

www.irma-international.org/chapter/concerns-mutual-constitution/24721